

August 28, 2017

Crushing of Asphalt and Concrete Debris

On January 18, 2017, I reached out to a Councilperson to ask if they had any contacts I could send an RFP to for crushing concrete and asphalt debris. They indicated that they were unsure of some of the math previously used to justify such work but that they did like the idea of repurposing material and that they wanted to explore the option of renting crushers and performing the work ourselves. I called a few companies (some that they had recommended and some that I had found) to ask about crusher rentals. All but one indicated that they either didn't rent them anymore or that our site and scope weren't viable for their equipment. I met with a rep from Wheeler machinery about rentals and ultimately felt that we did not have the manpower available to dedicate two people for three weeks and I also felt nervous about having inexperienced personnel operating a large crusher.

On March 27th, 2017, Kaysville City Public Works emailed requests for pricing to Crandall Rock, Marriott Construction, TLC Rock and Utah Sand. Pricing was for crushing debris stockpiles of approximately 4,700 CY of asphalt and 1,500 CY of concrete. In the RFP, Public Works asked for a unit price to crush the asphalt, a unit price to crush the concrete and an alternative price option for renting the company's crusher to run ourselves (this was done out of curiosity to better determine possible future pricing for self-performing the work).

Kaysville City received three responses: from TLC, Marriott Construction and Utah Sand. The results were such:

- TLC: \$10.63/CY asphalt, \$9.37/CY concrete (Crusher rental: \$310/hr)
- Utah Sand: \$6.59/CY asphalt, \$16.66/CY concrete (no crusher rental)
- Marriott: \$5.75 /CY asphalt, \$5.75/CY concrete (Crusher rental: \$28,000)

Upon reviewing the bids, it appeared that Marriott was the low price, so they were selected for the work at an estimated total of \$35,650. I made a mistake



SETTLED IN 1850

as the fact that the \$25,000 threshold that requires to send an item like this to the Council didn't even cross my mind. It was an honest mistake on my part, but a mistake nonetheless. Marriott performed the work, and invoiced us on 8/16/17.

The invoice total amounted to \$61,551.25. Surprised by the total, I looked at the items and saw \$26,772 for asphalt crushed, \$6,779.25 for concrete and \$28,000 for the crusher rental. I was originally seeking bids with unit prices that covered all work and costs, but Marriott had thought I just wanted a separate line item to isolate and track the cost for the crusher on its own. After realizing that the crusher "rental" was actually part of the price of crushing and factoring in the \$28,000, Marriott's bid was actually \$7,687 more than Utah Sand and \$366 less than TLC.

Looking back I should have thought to double check with all the vendors, but it seemed to meet what I was looking for, I saw the low bid and prematurely moved forward. In the end, we saved over \$4/ton on road base (see cost sheets), saved over 200 man hours by being able to dump material in town and we have material that meets state spec (see test result sheets) on hand at a moment's notice. This isn't an excuse for my failing to remember the procurement policy, but rather an explanation as to the benefits of continued use of this option.

Based on previous and existing patterns, we'd propose stockpiling debris for about 2 years, then crushing every other year as we either approach exhausting our stockpiles, or to help meet upcoming project demands. The budget line items for paying for the crushing of the material are 10-61-735 for streets, 51-40-480 for water and 56-40-480 for storm water.